



CREaTE

Canterbury Research and Theses Environment

Canterbury Christ Church University's repository of research outputs

<http://create.canterbury.ac.uk>

Please cite this publication as follows:

West, L. R. (2016) *Pedagogie di amore e odio: auto-identificazione nei processi educativi di gruppi islamici e di lavoratori nel Regno Unito = Pedagogies of love and hate: self-recognition in Islamist groups and workers' education in the United Kingdom*. *Pedagogia oggi*, 1. pp. 49-61. ISSN 1827-0824.

Link to official URL (if available):

This version is made available in accordance with publishers' policies. All material made available by CReaTE is protected by intellectual property law, including copyright law. Any use made of the contents should comply with the relevant law.

Contact: create.library@canterbury.ac.uk



Pedagogie di amore e odio: auto-identificazione nei processi educativi di gruppi islamici e di lavoratori nel Regno Unito

Pedagogies of Love and Hate: Self-Recognition in Islamist Groups and Workers' Education in the United Kingdom

Linden West

Questo documento si concentra sul gioco emotivo del mondo interiore rispetto alle relazioni e ai gruppi. Si basa su una ricerca auto/biografica narrativa svolta in una angosciata città post-industriale, alle prese con il razzismo e sacche di islamismo, ma anche con una storia gloriosa di istruzione dei lavoratori che è però ormai stata interrotta (West, 2016). Ho cercato di comprendere le dinamiche del razzismo, del fondamentalismo, dell'odio ma anche dell'amore e del riconoscimento nella costruzione della solidarietà sociale. L'articolo mostra dove le risorse di speranza per le nuove solidarietà sociali più inclusive possono trovarsi, in un momento di un individualismo sfrenato e crescente antagonismo fra i gruppi etnici a livello nazionale così come a livello internazionale. Il documento si avvale di un quadro teorico psicosociale interdisciplinare, attingendo allo psicoanalista Donald Winnicott, al teorico critico Axel Honneth e a John Dewey, per illuminare particolari dinamiche, tra cui quelle pedagogiche, all'interno dell'islamismo, in contesti di crescente islamofobia. L'interazione di queste forze può attrarre individui alienati verso l'islamismo, che offre potenti forme di riconoscimento di sé. Questi processi operano ad un livello emotivo e narrativo primitivo. Il riconoscimento dà significato e scopo alle vite spezzate, ma può anche essere impregnato di misconoscimento dell'altro. Ci possono essere processi di scissione psichica collettiva in cui le parti indesiderate di un sé e la cultura stessa vengono proiettate nell'altro, producendo alienazione, per ironia della sorte, per sé e per altri, in nome della purezza. L'odio prende il sopravvento. Queste dinamiche riduttive sono confrontate, nella carta, con quello che è stato chiamato 'un esperimento di educazione democratica' nella città stessa. L'esperimento è stato il prodotto di un'alleanza insolita, almeno in un contesto europeo, tra elementi progressivi nelle università e organizzazioni della classe operaia, all'inizio del secolo scorso. Ha fornito l'accesso a particolari forme di istruzione universitaria, così come una formazione dei cittadini a livello locale. Vorrei attirare l'attenzione su testimonianze personali e recenti ricerche, a suggerire che l'educazione dei lavoratori ha offerto forme di riconoscimento e mezzi per rafforzare la solidarietà sociale. Uo-

This paper focuses on the emotional interplay of the inner world with the relationships and groups in which we are embedded. It draws on in-depth auto/biographical narrative research in one distressed post-industrial city struggling with racism and pockets of Islamism, but also with a proud history of workers' education that has now fractured (West, 2016). I sought to understand the dynamics of racism, fundamentalism, and of hate, but also of love and recognition in the building of social solidarities. The paper illuminates where resources of hope for new, more inclusive social solidarities can lie, at a time of a rampant individualism and growing antagonism between ethnic groups at national as well as international levels. The paper employs an interdisciplinary psychosocial theoretical frame, drawing on psychoanalyst Donald Winnicott, critical theorist Axel Honneth and educator John Dewey, to illuminate particular dynamics, including pedagogic, within Islamism, in contexts of growing Islamophobia. The interplay of these forces can draw alienated individuals into Islamism, which provides powerful forms of self recognition. These processes operate at a primitive emotional as well as narrative level. Recognition gives meaning and purpose to fractured lives but may also be impregnated with misconstruction of the other. There can be processes of collective psychic splitting in which unwanted parts of a self and culture are projected into the other, evoking alienation, ironically, from self as well as that other, in the name of purity. Hate takes over. These reductive dynamics are compared, in the paper, with what was called 'an experiment in democratic education' in the same city. The experiment was the product of an unusual alliance, at least in a European context, between progressive elements in universities and working class organisations at the beginning of the last century. It provided access to particular forms of university education, an education of citizens, at a local level. I draw on personal testimonies and recent research, to suggest that such workers' education offered forms of recognition and the means to strengthen social solidarities. Working class men and women became, in effect, university stu-

mini e donne della classe lavoratrice sono diventati, in effetti, studenti universitari, a livello locale, nelle città industriali e nelle città, classi chiamate 'classi assistite da tutor'. Non erano impartite lezioni, e 'tutti erano insegnanti e studenti', negoziando il proprio piano di studi e lavorando dialogicamente. Sono diventati o erano già leader e attivisti nelle loro comunità. Nel corso del tempo molti lavoratori-studenti sono diventati anche più aperti a riconoscere la diversità simbolica e, in alcuni casi, un certo loro bigottismo. I processi di auto-riconoscimento operarono anche qui, ma al fianco di un impegno relativamente aperto verso la diversità simbolica, gli altri e, quindi, il potenziale di diversità del sé. Questo ha fornito la base per un pieno riconoscimento dell'altro. Abbiamo bisogno di salvare tali storie trascurate e talvolta screditate, in un momento di frammentazione sociale e di crescente xenofobia.

dents, at a local level, in industrial towns and cities, in what were called 'tutorial classes'. They were classes not lectures, and 'all were teachers and learners' as they negotiated their own syllabus and worked dialogically. They became or were already leaders and activists in their communities. Over time many worker-students also became more open to symbolic diversity and, in some cases, to their own bigotry. Processes of self-recognition operated here too, but alongside relatively open engagement with symbolic diversity, with others, and thus with the potential diversity of self. This provided the basis for more fulsome recognition of the other. We need to rescue such neglected and sometimes disparaged histories, at a time of social fragmentation and growing xenophobia.

Parole Chiave: odiare, amore, psicosociale

Keywords: Hate, Love, Psychosocial

Articolo ricevuto: 23 gennaio 2016

Versione finale: 29 febbraio 2016

This paper focuses on the emotional interplay of the psychological world with the relationships and groups in which we are embedded. It draws on auto/biographical narrative research in one distressed post-industrial city struggling with racism and pockets of Islamism, but also with a proud history of workers' education that has now fractured (West, 2016). I wanted to understand the dynamics of racism, fundamentalism, and of hate, but also of love and recognition in the building of social solidarities. I illuminate where resources of hope for new, more inclusive social solidarities might lie, at a time of a rampant individualism and growing antagonism between ethnic groups at national as well as international levels. I use an interdisciplinary psychosocial theoretical frame, drawing on psychoanalyst Donald Winnicott, critical theorist Axel Honneth and educator John Dewey, to illuminate particular dynamics, including pedagogic, within Islamism, in contexts of growing Islamophobia. The interplay of these forces can draw alienated individuals into Islamism, which provides powerful forms of self recognition. These processes operate at a primitive emotional as well as narrative level. Recognition gives meaning and purpose to fractured lives but may also be impregnated with misrecognition of the other. There can be processes of collective psychic splitting in which unwanted parts of a self and culture are projected

into the other, evoking alienation, ironically, from self as well as that other, in the name of purity. Hate takes over.

These reductive dynamics are compared with what was called 'an experiment in democratic education' in the same city. This was the product of an unusual alliance, at least in a European context, between progressive elements in universities and working class organisations at the beginning of the last century to provide access to particular forms of university education, in a kind of education of citizens, at a local level (Rose, 2010; West, 1972). Drawing on personal testimonies and more recent research, such workers' education, I suggest, offered forms of recognition and structures of hope. Working class men and women became university students, at a local level, in industrial towns and cities, in what were called 'tutorial classes'. These were classes not lectures: 30 or so worker-students met weekly with a university tutor in their own locality, and 'all were teachers and learners' as they negotiated their own syllabus and worked dialogically. They became or were already leaders and activists in their communities. Over time many worker-students also became more open to symbolic diversity and, in some cases, to their own bigotry. Processes of self-recognition operated here too, but alongside relatively open engagement with symbolic diversity, with others, and thus with the potential diversity of self. This provided the basis for more fulsome recognition of the other and for building inclusive social solidarities.

THE CITY

I was, in 2008, deeply troubled by racism and fundamentalism as well as the neglect of the city of my birth, Stoke-on-Trent, in the English Midlands. I wanted to explore the psychosocial, cultural, political and economic roots of this. I conducted auto/biographical narrative research, some of it longitudinal, with over 50 people in the city, from different ethnic groups. I sought to connect larger historical forces (such as deindustrialisation) with the meso or intermediate levels of human interaction, of what was happening within institutions and groups as well as at an intimate relational level. I attempted to illuminate how and why xenophobia flourishes and to think seriously about it and its antidotes. In 2008/9 the racist British National Party (BNP) was on the rise in the city; and a mosque was pipe-bombed. It seemed that racists would form the majority on the Municipal Council by 2010 (West, 2016).

The traditional economic base of the city – coal mining, iron and steel production and pottery had either disappeared or drastically declined. Long-term structural unemployment was endemic (West, 2016). The financial crisis, from 2008, austerity and cuts in local government funding added to feelings of despair. I visited a district of the city called Etruria, where, in the eighteenth century, Josiah Wedgwood built his second factory, and he named the area after the region

of Italy whose ancient pottery so inspired him. Wedgwood's house is still there, part of a hotel chain, and there was new development, including the expanding headquarters of the betting giant, Bet365. But dereliction met the eye at the abandoned railway station, framed by a disused, vandalized factory site.

RECOGNITION AND THE POWER TO ILLUMINATE

There were particular theoretical friends - Dewey, Winnicott and Honneth – who helped me make sense of the stories I heard. The power of the methodology illuminated biographical experiences in ways that more conventional research might get nowhere near. Using Dewey also reminded me of our need to engage with the other precisely because of the limitations, despite our best efforts, of what we can ever know. The other, in short, has an actual importance for the quality of our own psychological and symbolic life; diversity matters in the groups of which we are a part, whether scientific or community-based, for the quality of our thinking and actions, for the cultivation of what we can call democratic subjectivity – or the cosmopolitan psyche – as a prerequisite for wider human well-being (West, 2016).

Such selves may also be more or less agentic and political in quite a basic sense: the nurturing of children – or adults for that matter – is a political as well as an emotional act. It is about cultivating relationships in which individuals feel legitimate and able to question the taken-for-granted without experiencing paralyzing anxiety. This can involve experiencing the world as a place for imaginative play, in Winnicott's terms, for the playfulness of ideas and the imagination, or – at an opposite end of a spectrum – to be overly defensive, to avoid difficulty because it is too threatening to self or a group. Such individuals can don false mantles, needing to please or appease others for fear of displeasure or abandonment. The intimately personal is deeply political and potentially democratic in these terms. Axel Honneth (2009) refers to Freud's anthropological idea of how we are born prematurely in comparison with other mammals and depend absolutely on the other for survival and well-being; and on feelings of being loved as a fundamental basis for human flourishing (Winnicott, 1971). The love on offer, however, may not be good enough, and survival can come at the price of self-annihilation, if the other, for instance, has constantly to be appeased. Honneth adds the sociocultural into these more intimate dynamics of self-recognition. This includes the role of groups in providing self-respect, in making people feeling accepted and that they belong, with rights and responsibilities. Self-esteem, Honneth's third category of self-recognition, can then be nurtured when individuals feel recognized as making important contributions to a group's well-being, which provides a potential to better recognize others (Honneth, 2007; 2009); a potential but not an inevitability.

Auto/biographical narrative enquiry sheds light, through the richness of storytelling, especially when done longitudinally, over cycles of interviews, on the seductions and insecurities fuelling racism and fundamentalism, and how and why space once existed, and can be created again, for the never-complete experiment in democratic education. The distinct methodology has been finely tuned over many years and pays attention to how we as researchers shape responses 'auto/biographically'. The research is conducted in a clinical style and is sensitive to and reflexive about how emotional, unconscious, intersubjective and power dynamics work between people; how we are present as researchers in the process, for better as well as worse. We seek to create the conditions for good, more inclusive and hopeful stories, through our presence, when we are respectful, listen seriously, and feedback ideas for reflection, in a digestible form. Donning the metaphorical mantle of the white-coated, emotionally distant scientific investigator, on the other hand, can silence the other: we need our humanity and creativity in making good, dialogical research (Merrill and West, 2009).

There is an historical dimension to this paper. I re-engaged from 2008 onwards with the historical contribution of workers' education in Stoke and revisited my writing from the 1970s. The late nineteenth century witnessed, in Britain, the foundation of many organizations devoted to educating men and women for active participation in political and, increasingly, social democracy (Tawney, 1964). However, some historians concluded that workers' education of a non-politically partisan kind, in alliance with progressive elements in universities, served to neuter and de-radicalize working-class students. From this perspective radical autodidactic passions were channelled into the calmer, more respectable waters of university learning and a hegemonic national culture. Workers' education, in such terms, served official state policy, and was correspondingly funded. Thus its role was about far more than the dispositions of individual teachers and students: it was functionally conservative in relation to the established order. This was powerful criticism and in diluted form I was a critic (West, 1972; 2016).

ISLAMISM IN THE CITY

People of South Asian origin had settled in Stoke from the 1960s onwards. They mainly came from Pakistan and Bangladesh, and now make up about 50 per cent of the city's ethnic minority population. In 2011 they numbered just over 9000 (Burnett, 2011), at a time when the city's white population had been in decline. In one district in the north of the city, over 30 per cent of its residents are from ethnic minority communities (Burnett, 2011). People of South Asian origin talked in the research about disrespect and everyday experiences of Islamophobia: among taxi drivers, for instance, told too frequently to 'fuck off home'. This sense of everyday disrespect was amplified by stories of actual physical vio-

lence: particular Asian people had been killed or injured and mosques damaged. Such a reality can produce insecurity, vulnerability and defensiveness – paranoia even – and reinforces the tendency for people to congregate in particular areas among their own.

Islamic fundamentalism has attracted certain young people in particular mosques. Small numbers, but they exist. The groups offer recognition but this is then followed by scapegoating narratives and the stereotyping of difference. The perception of others becomes a self-motivated distortion accompanied by an idealization of self and one's own culture. There is a psychological splitting between 'good' and 'bad', in which unwanted parts of one's own personal and collective identity – the pursuit of material wealth or pleasure, for instance, or the sexualisation of women or a capacity for violence – are projected onto the other of, say, the white working class estate. Such groups, however, also provide meaning, purpose, identity and recognition in lives. They offer compelling, if warped, narratives of what the problem actually is: it is the other.

There is an important material as well as cultural aspect to these processes in the city. In marginalized Muslim communities of high unemployment, for instance, the absence of occupational structures creates special problems of transition for vulnerable young men. Culturally, as occupational structures have fractured, processes of transition from being a son to the head of a household, and thus finding existential meaning and a purposeful role, have become problematic. Relationships between the generations suffer too, as male initiation rituals between fathers and sons, in the workplace, are lost. Narratives of the 'Christian' neglect of white Muslims in the Bosnian conflict, in contrast to the 'Christian' (that is Russian Orthodox) support for the 'Christian' Serbs, filled some of this economic and intergenerational vacuum. In the 1990s actions by the West, standing back as Muslims were slaughtered, were essentially seen as anti-Islamic rather than racist, given that the Muslims were white. Certain young people inwardly digested stories of Muslim humiliation, collective trauma and 'Christian' hostility, and a need to fight back. This was then fuelled by the toxicity of Islamophobia.

A community leader, who I call Aasif, talked about some of the above:

... you had groups like Hizb ut-Tahrir taking advantage of the situation in Bosnia ... with what's happening with the Muslims ... arms not being allowed to get to the Muslims to defend themselves where Russia is providing the Christian Serbs; it was a them-against-us kind of debate with groups like Hizb ut-Tahrir ... talking about the male Muslim section of Muslim community at that time; the youth, low education achievement, low aspiration ... no job opportunity... perfect audience... you can recruit easy ... It's nothing to do with the colour of your skin; this is not racism; this is a target on the Muslim community because these Muslims are white ... I can remember some of these Hizb ut-Tahrir members who in the early '90s, pulling the youth away from the parents as well ...

From this perspective, Bosnia was a trauma in which scales fell from the eyes: it led to increased politicization and provided a mythic rationale for fundamentalism (Varvin, 2012). A group like Hizb ut-Tahrir (or Liberation Party) – حزب التحرير, in the Arabic – could exploit such feelings. Hizb ut-Tahrir is an international pan-Islamic political organization commonly associated with the goal of all Muslim countries unifying into one Islamic caliphate, ruled by sharia law. Hizb ut-Tahrir was founded in 1952 as part of a movement to create a new elite among Muslim youth. The writings of the group's founder, Shaikh Taqi al-Dine al-Nabahani, lay down detailed descriptions for a restored caliphate (Ruthven, 2012).

RAAFE

I will use narrative material from individuals close to particular jihadists. I paint a portrait of someone I call Raafe, a quasi-fictional composite derived from multiple narratives. Raafe – which in Arabic means companion – was radicalized and sought to radicalize others. Particular mosques provided space for him, apparently without the elders or imams knowing. They became in effect, locations for pedagogy of a fundamentalist kind.

Another community leader, Aatif, told me about the weaknesses of mosque management and how this was exploited by Raafe and others. Raafe, I was told, was an individual 'who had a very troubled upbringing'. He along with other 'radicalizers', as they were called, targeted young people:

... Raafe didn't have a very good relationship with his father ended up in crime ... was sent down to prison ... Came out of prison and he was within a few weeks, he was, he had transformed into somebody who was a practising Muslim now to hear him ... later on when we realized he was part of Hizb ut-Tahrir, but at that point to see somebody change so dramatically was wow, he made a real positive change ... you couldn't explain to your parents why you wanted to ... your parents who came in the early '60s ... came when they were young ... so very little ... religious... education ... so they didn't have...opportunity to question the imams and learn something; so they couldn't pass that religious knowledge on to the youth, to their children; so the parents relied upon the mosques to offer that ... so that's where the communication barrier helped groups like Hizb ut-Tahrir. We can offer you Islamic information in your language, that's what attracted a lot of people in Stoke-on-Trent on topical issues ...

Radicalization transformed the lives of some individuals, providing meaning, purpose and self-recognition. Raafe's own transformation may well have depended on feeling understood, listened to and respected, and then accepted by radical groups in prison

The pedagogy of radicalization seems to work by emotional, imaginative appeals to the past constructed in the light of the present. It involves stories and appeals to action, rather than textual hermeneutics. Narratives of twelfth-century victories supported a call for similar jihad now, one requiring toughness and heroism. Jihad, or struggle, becomes constructed as a heavy responsibility that requires toughness, even brutality. The victory of the Muslim armies, led by the King of Jerusalem, Guy of Lusignan, against the Crusaders in the twelfth century's Battle of Hattin, is interpreted as the outcome of a long process of small-scale, hard hitting attacks in various locations. Past struggles get reinterpreted in the light of the present in the struggle against the new crusaders of the West and its client states; against the army of Rome as it is described. Heroism and martyrdom are called for in what is a very different pedagogical process from rational, textual analysis of the Qur'an. Muslim clerics may speak in the language of theory; the jihadi groups act through stories and doing (Hassan and Weiss, 2015).

WORKERS' EDUCATION

Workers education once thrived in the same city. The first ever university tutorial class, of the kind mentioned above, took place there in 1908, when 30 or so worker students met each Friday evening over a period of years with their tutor, R.H. Tawney, a subsequently distinguished economic historian, representing the University of Oxford. The classes were free from prescribed curricula, and its members could explore issues in their working lives from the perspectives of history, politics, economics and literature. Fortnightly essays were required, and the standard of some of these was high, although by no means all (West, 1972; Goldman, 1995). There were no formal examinations or qualifications due to a desire to eliminate competition and vocationalism from the classroom (West, 1972; Rose, 2010). The Marxist Social Democratic Federation made up the nucleus of students who were potters, miners, clerks, shop assistants and school teachers. Many students were from non-conformist religious backgrounds, from families that encouraged them to think for themselves. The Social Democratic Federation was strongly opposed to the British Liberal Party of the time, with a progressive programme calling for a 48-hour working week, the abolition of child labour, compulsory free secular education, equality for women and the socialization of the means of production, distribution and exchange.

Tawney himself thought the tutorial class 'movement' and the Workers' Educational Association (WEA) a successful 'experiment in democratic education', which had a profound influence on the development of British social democracy. According to Tawney, the WEA was founded on three core principles. First, the opposition to revolutionary violence: 'one may not do evil that good should come', in Cobbett's dictum of a century before. Second, no institution, however

perfect in conception, could be made to work effectively by individuals whose morality was inadequate. Third, where a sound morality was lacking, this could be forged in a community of scholars seeking truth and the common good (Dennis and Halsey, 1988). There was an Aristotelian ideal at work here, as well as Oxford idealism (Goldman, 1995), an ideal of the fully developed person living in communities, building and sustaining virtue – communities cultivating not self- but other-regardness, collectively directing themselves to higher aims than the purely egotistic or narcissistic (Dennis and Halsey, 1988). The idealists at Oxford who influenced Tawney - opposed to individualism, utilitarianism and social atomism - drew on German philosophers, especially Kant and Hegel, and the notion that individuals can only be understood and realize their potential in the collective. Men and women were part of social and political communities from which they could not be divorced for analytic or practical purposes. They were linked together by values and institutions rather than simply webs of economic relationships.

Tawneyite ways of thinking became unfashionable after the Second World War. He himself had doubts about the tutorial classes, not least the intellectual and emotional effort required from the worker students. Tawney was also far from a naïve idealist and there were 'limits to his moralising', as Laurence Goldman notes (Goldman, 1995: 160). He was also aware that the same spirit of non-conformity that drove some of the worker students could also narrow viewpoints and bring a tendency to over-proselytize that made it difficult to take on board different perspectives.

Jonathan Rose's recent historical work has rescued Tawney and workers' education from the condescension of posterity (Rose, 2010). Rose, drawing on diverse forms of life writing, chronicled the importance of relationship and recognition in workers' education: between tutors and students, among students, but also in relation to the symbolic world, in challenging bigotry and fascism, for instance, and for cultivating agency at an individual and collective level.

Such education offered working-class people avenues into leadership roles in local and national politics, and served to radicalize and motivate them in personal as well as political ways. Surveys of the students showed that most were taking part in trade union activity, cooperative societies, local authorities, religious and political bodies. They were building a workers' education but also a broader social democratic movement.

SPACE TO FEEL RECOGNISED

The classes themselves created space to question and challenge racism and other forms of bigotry in transformational ways. In one telling account, Nancy Dobrin, born in 1914, writes that the study of literature had revolutionary conse-

quences for her. She grew up in a home where learning was not valued, where there was either 'a row or an order'. She read little but later joined a WEA class and read avidly, although she admitted that she went to the class partly in search of a man. Nancy became a writer herself. She described working for a German Jew during the Second World War, wondering what on earth he was doing and why couldn't people like him go home. Later, in another class, she met her future husband, a German Jewish refugee who described himself as a Christian Communist. This was a relationship formed in the spaces of workers' education, where literature – from Lawrence, Tolstoy and James Joyce – enabled her to question her own bigotry. Such experiences duly shaped her relationships with her children and family, and impelled her to question aspects of their schooling. Agency can take many forms: in the everyday, in families and on the wider democratic stage.

In certain respects, Nancy's story resembles those of later adult students, such as Brenda, in my own research among non-traditional adult students at university in the 1990s (West, 1996). Brenda also found some recognition of self and experience in particular tutors and students as well as in literature. Brenda would relate to fictional characters, such as an abused but resilient woman in a novel by Maupassant. The character, so to speak, became part of Brenda's internal world through processes of projective identification – finding aspects of self in the fictional or actual other – and imaginatively experiencing their lives and internalizing some of their strength and resilience.

These dynamics can be incorporated into a more developed, nuanced theory of recognition, one embracing the imaginal and the symbolic, and which actively engages emotion as well as mind. It also suggests a developmental rather than fixed self, more open to recognition by teachers, as well as feeling recognised in the symbolic and imaginative order. Like Nancy, Brenda learned to play with ideas and feel valued for it. She also learned, like many other adult students, a more democratic sensibility in the tutorial classes and later, which they describe in their own words (West, 1996; Rose, 2010: 274–5).

DOGMATISM AND ITS ROOTS

But dogmatism existed in the tutorial classes too, rooted no doubt in human fragility. It is interesting that the worker students frequently admired tutors like Tawney, who remained steadfast as well as respectful even when harangued by a fundamentalist student. We can think of fundamentalism, like its variant Islamism, as ordinary – when we feel out of our depth we may grab at things that seem to offer narrative certainty, an answer to everything. Leftist fundamentalists sometimes from the Social Democratic Federation and later the Communist Party, though not exclusively so, would quote from texts like *Das Capital* with reli-

gious fervour. The other students admired how Tawney remained respectful in the face of agitation. One recalled a particular Marxist – the SDF could dominate the first tutorial classes – challenging point after point and referring to classic Marxist texts. Tawney took it in his stride but insisted that there were other points of view. The student accused the tutor of hopping around from twig to twig, like a bird, and a sense of bad temper pervaded the room. Tawney insisted that everyone, including his challenger, take tea together afterwards and tell stories, read poetry and sing songs. This enabled the group to re-establish some shared humanity and fraternity (Rose, 2010: 266).

It is worth noting that a wider reevaluation of Tawney's contribution to theorizing the role and practice of inclusive university education as a basis for more effective political democracy and building social solidarities is taking place (Holford, 2015; Goldman, 2013). Tawney emphasized the moral and spiritual in human betterment, and this could be embodied in the tutorial classes in ways that inspired wider communities and ideas of fellowship and service more generally. The aim of the tutorial classes was to make university education available to all people in their own localities: very different to today's assumptions about the purpose of higher education for individual social mobility.

Tawney was committed to a liberal and humane view of education for everyone, where citizens could acquire civic qualities and understanding in the struggle to create forms of social cooperation and mutual understanding rather than conflict and violence. Holford suggests that Tawney offers a localist critique to the current emphasis on developing global skills and mobility.

Communities should not be privileged or discounted because of their wealth or poverty and universities should be active agents in communities via, for instance, adult education. Moreover, Tawney represents a more constructivist view of knowledge: the classes were classes, not lectures, and ideas were explored and developed in discussion. The processes of education were democratic – students engaged in research and discovery by using original source material like historical documents, rather than being the passive recipients of received wisdom (Holford, 2015).

CONCLUSION: DEVELOPING A THEORY OF SELF-RECOGNITION

The research helps to develop Honneth's concept of recognition and to illuminate the role of the group as well as more intimate relationships in creating what we can term loving, more reciprocal relationships and, in certain cases, the spirit of openness to the other. In the tutorial classes, people talked of feeling respected, listened to and understood as well as legitimate in the academic world; we could call this feeling loved in a non-narcissistic sense: a process of recognition working at intimate emotional, relational as well as cognitive levels. Self-

respect was generated too which strengthened the capacity for recognising others and an ethos of rights and responsibilities and solidarity across difference. The classes provided emotional, narrative and intellectual resources for agency in both intimate space and a wider social world. The dynamics of recognition and its democratizing spirit resonate across the narratives and speak to us at a time when representative democracy seems fragile and racism gets stronger.

But recognition, and feeling cared for and understood, loved maybe, can lead to destructive ends too. Raafe, it seems, felt cared for in prison, his struggles were recognised and new narrative resources made available. He was enabled to work among other alienated young Muslims, to care for them (he ran youth groups). They no doubt felt recognised in turn, by someone they admired, because he spoke to their concerns, with an apparent authority.

They undoubtedly found self-recognition in groups and in new narratives, ones making connections over time. Narratives that explained suffering and the need for heroic struggle against crusaders. Such dynamics, however ultimately perverted, provided existential meaning and the promise, even, of entry into Paradise. The Islamist groups gave self-respect and esteem, but alongside hatred of the other, destroying the possibility of new forms of inclusive social solidarity.

A developed theory of recognition should include appreciation of our shared vulnerability and a common need for love, affirmation, respect, esteem and narrative connections. Dependency is hardwired into us in what the psychoanalyst Melanie Klein called memory in feeling: our effort to transcend the anxiety associated with separation processes requires loving and challenging relationships. Such primitive dimensions of recognition may play out in later life, in a struggle to make a point in a tutorial class, perhaps, or to feel accepted in a Jihadi group. Processes of recognition encompass largely unconscious, emotional as well as wider social dynamics and cognition.

Workers' education once afforded ordinary people self-recognition, through being understood, and with a right to be heard and fully participate; and to be respected and listened to as mature and capable people. Recognition, to repeat, is more easily given when we ourselves feel recognized. Honneth's idea of recognition is not about having a good opinion of ourselves but rather emanates from the feeling of a shared dignity of persons who are morally responsible agents, capable of participating in public deliberation and action, for better as well as worse. John Dewey (1969) additionally offers a crucial insight into the good and less good group: the former is open to diversity and otherness, including narrative; the latter is ultimately closed and calcified in allusions of total truth and purity.

REFERENCES

- AUESTAD, L. (ed.), *Psychoanalysis and Politics: Exclusion and the politics of representation*. Karnac, London 2012.
- AUSTED, L., *Nationalism and the Body Politic*. Karnac, London 2014.
- BURNETT, J., *The New Geographies of Racism: Stoke-on-Trent*. Institute of Race Relations, London 2011.
- DENNIS, A. AND HALSEY, A.H., *English Ethical Socialism: Thomas More to R.H. Tawney*. Clarendon Press, Oxford 1988.
- DEWEY, J., 'The ethics of democracy'. In Boydston, J.A. *The Early Years of John Dewey*. Southern Illinois University Press, Carbondale, IL 1969.
- FLEMMEN, H., 'Fundamentalism, Nazism and inferiority'. In Auestad, L. (ed.) *Nationalism and the Body Politic*. Karnac, London 2014.
- GOLDMAN, L., *Dons and Workers: Oxford and adult education since 1850*. Clarendon Press, Oxford 1995.
- GOLDMAN, L., *The Life of R.H. Tawney: Socialism and history*. Bloomsbury Academic, London 2013.
- HASSAN, H. AND WEISS, M., *ISIS: Inside the army of terror*. Regan Arts, New York 2015.
- HOLFORD, J. (2015) 'Adult and higher education in the early work of R.H. Tawney'. In Standing Conference of University Teachers and Researchers in the Education of Adults (SCUTREA) *It's all Adult Education*. Paper presented at a conference held at the University of Leeds, 7–9 July.
- HONNETH, A., *Disrespect: The normative foundations of critical theory*. Polity Press, Cambridge 2007.
- HONNETH, A., *Pathologies of Reason: On the legacy of critical theory*. Columbia University Press, New York 2009.
- MERRILL B. AND WEST, L., *Using Biographical Methods in Social Research*. Sage, London 2009.
- ROSE, J., *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*. 2nd ed. Yale University Press, New York 2010.
- RUTHVEN, M., *Islam: A very short introduction*. University Press, Oxford 2012.
- TAWNEY, R., *The Radical Tradition*. Penguin, London 1964.
- VARVIN, S., 'Islamism and xenophobia'. In Auestad, L. (ed.) *Nationalism and the Body Politic*. Karnac, London 2012.
- WEST, L. (1972) 'The Tawney legend re-examined'. *Studies in Adult Education*, 4, (2), 105–119.
- WEST, L., *Beyond Fragments: Adults, motivation and higher education. A biographical analysis*. Taylor and Francis, London 1996.
- WEST, L., *Distress in the city; racism, fundamentalism and a democratic education*. UCL Books, London Trentham 2016.
- WINNICOTT, D., *Playing and Reality*. Routledge, London 1971.